UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO FACULTY OF LAW
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06100006 3

# FAMILY LAW

## Cases and Materials

## Volume I

Brenda Cossman and Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2009-2010

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP 2 2 2009

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

# FAMILY LAW

## Cases and Materials

## Volume I

Brenda Cossman and Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2009-2010

* * *

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcasesma01coss_6

# FAMILY LAW
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Volume I**

**Page No.**


## I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

### A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents ..... 1
Margrit Eichler, "Beyond the Monolithic Bias in Family Literature," *Families in Canada Today* (Toronto: Gage, 1983) at 3 ..... 2
Vanier Institute of the Family, "Definitions of Family," *Profiling Canada's Families* (1994) at 10-11 ..... 5
Vanier Institute of the Family, "Highlights and Top 10 Trends for Canadian Families", *Profiling Canada's Families III* (2004) at xv-xvi ..... 6
Statistics Canada, *Family Portrait ... 2006*, "Highlights of 2006 Census" ..... 8
Statistics Canada, "Census Snapshot of Canada-Families" ..... 10
Statistics Canada, "2006 Census: Ethnic Origin [and] Visible Minorities ..... 12
"Highlights", *Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile 2008* (Statistics Canada, Canadian Centre for Justice Studies, 2008) ..... 14
Krista Foss, "Men as likely to face abuse from partner, Statscan says," *The Globe and Mail*, 27 June 2002 ..... 17

### B. Recent Challenges to the Family

*Canada (Attorney General) v. Mossop*, [1993] 1 S.C.R. 554 ..... 19
*Egan v. Canada*, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 513 ..... 26

### C. Legal Regulation of the Family

*Balfour v. Balfour*, [1919] 2 K.B. 571 (C.A.) ..... 29
F. Olsen, "The Family and The Market: A Study of Ideology and Legal Reform" (1983), Harvard L.Rev. 1497 ..... 30
John Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy*, 2d ed. (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1984) at 15-26 ..... 32
Mary Ann Glendon, *Abortion and Divorce in Western Law* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987) at 7-9 ..... 37

## II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

### A. The Significance of Marriage

#### (a) The Social Context of Marriage

Statistics Canada, "Family Portrait ... 2006" ..... 39
Statistics Canada, "Marriages", *The Daily*, Jan. 17, 2007 ..... 45
Note: Recent Marriage Statistics, 2004-2008 ..... 47

#### (b) The Shifting Legal Significance of Marriage

Sir William Blackstone, *Commentaries on the Laws of England* ..... 48

William Cobbett, *Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women* (1837) ..... 48
Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* (1985) at 3 ..... 46
*Hyde v. Hyde* (1886), 1 L.R. (P & D) 130 ..... 49
*Graham v. Graham*, 33 F. Supp. 936 (1940) ..... 49
Shelagh Day, "The Charter and Family Law" in Elisabeth Sloss, ed., *Family Law in Canada: New Directions* (Ottawa: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women, 1985) 27 at 28-30. ..... 51
Mary Ann Glendon, "The New Marriage and the New Property" in J. Eekelaar and S. Katz, eds., *Marriage and Cohabitation in Contemporary Societies* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1978) at 59-70 ..... 52

**B. Unmarried Cohabitation**

Note: Terminology ..... 59
Statistics Canada, "Family Portrait … 2006" ..... 60
"Then They Won't Get Married" Siri Argell, *Globe and Mail*, Sept. 13, 2007 ..... 64
"The New Traditionalists" Leah McLaren, *Globe and Mail*, June 14, 2003 ..... 65
Anne-Marie Ambert, "Cohabitation and Marriage: How are they Related?" (Vanier Institute of the Family, Sept. 2005) ..... 69
W. Holland, "Cohabitation and Marriage—A Meeting at the Crossroads?" (1990-1991) 7 *C.F.L.Q.* 33 ..... 75
*Miron v. Trudel* [1995] 2 S.C.R. 418; 124 D.L.R. (4th) 693 ..... 79
*Molodowich v. Penttinen* (1980), 17 R.F.L. (2d) 376 (Ont. Dist. Ct.) ..... 83
*Stoikiewicz v. Filas* (1978), 7 R.F.L. (2d) 366, 21 O.R. (2d) 717 (U.F.C.) ..... 87
*Le Labbe and McCullough* (1979), 23 O.R. (2d) 536 (Prov. Ct.) ..... 89
Note: *Macmillan-Dekker v. Dekker* (2000), 10 R.F.L. (5th) 352 (Ont. S.C.J.) ..... 90
Note: *Campbell v. Szoke* (2003), 45 R.F.L. (5th) 261 (Ont. S.C.J.) ..... 91
"Ontario's Divisional Court to rule on whether mistress might win spousal support", *Lawyers Weekly*, Nov. 1. 2002 ..... 91
Note: Stephen v. Stawecki (2006), 32 R.F.L. (6th) 282 (Ont. C.A.) ..... 93
*M. v. H.*, [1999] 2 S.C.R. 3 ..... 94
Note: Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act* (1993) ..... 109
Note: The Legislative Response to *M. v. H.* ..... 110
*Nova Scotia (Attorney General) v. Walsh*, [2002] 2 S.C.R. 325 ..... 111
Note: *Hodge v. Canada (Minister of Human Resources Development)*, [2004] 3 S.C.R. 357 ..... 128
Note: Legal Recognition and Regulation of Non-Conjugal Personal Relationships ..... 130
"Single Judge Seeks Benefits of Couples", *National Post*, Sept. 22, 2004 ..... 131
"Challenging Couple-ism", Editorial, *National Post*, Sept. 23, 2004 ..... 132
Note: Australia's *Domestic Relationships Act* ..... 133
Note: Alberta's *Adult Interdependent Relationships Act* (2003) ..... 133
Law Commission of Canada, "Beyond Conjugality: Recognizing and Supporting Close Personal Adult Relationships ..... 136

**C. Validity of Marriage**

**(a) Overview**

H. R. Hahlo, *Nullity of Marriage in Canada* (1979) at 1-5 ..... 141
Berend Hovius, Note on Validity of Marriage, ..... 141
Peter Hogg, *Constitutional Law of Canada* (1985) at 533-534 ..... 143

**(b) Opposite Sexes**

Note: Same Sex Marriage and the Legal Recognition of Same Sex Relationships ..... 144
*Halpern v. Canada (A.G.)* (2002), 60 O.R. (3d) 32 (Ont. Div. Ct.) ..... 146
*Halpern v. Canada (A.G.)* (2003), 225 D.L.R.(4th) 529 (Ont. C.A.) ..... 156
Note: The Same-Sex Marriage Reference ..... 167
*Reference re Same-Sex Marriage*, [2004] 3 S.C.R. 698 ..... 167
Note: The *Civil Marriage Act* (2005) ..... 174
Note: Same Sex Marriage and Religious Freedom ..... 174
Dan Shoudice, "Refusal to Perform Same-Sex Marriage Costs Sask. Marriage Commissioner $2500" (Centre for Constitutional Studies, July 27, 2009) ..... 175
Note: Foreign Recognition of Canadian SameSex Marriages ..... 176
"Same-Sex couples get travel warning", *Globe and Mail*, July 25, 2005 ..... 176
"Couple test British court on gay marriage", *Globe and Mail*, Aug. 17, 2005 ..... 177
Note: Recognition of Out of Jurisdiction Same Sex Marriages in New York and Israel ..... 178
Note: Same-Sex Marriage Developments in the United States ..... 179

**(c) Capacity to Consummate**

*Gajamugan v. Gajamugan* (1979), 10 R.F.L. (2d) 280 (Ont. S.C.) ..... 181
*Dashevsky v. Dashevsky* (1973), 13 R.F.L. 1 (Ont. S.C.) ..... 182
*Norman v. Norman* (1979), 9 R.F.L. (2d) 235 (Ont. U.F.C.) ..... 185
"Judge refuses to annul unconsummated marriage" (re *Falk v. Falk*), *Lawyers Weekly*, Oct. 1. 1999 ..... 186
Note: *L. (K.H.) v. L. (G.Q.)* (2003), 231 D.L.R. (4th) 677 (B.C.C.A.) ..... 187

**(d) Monogamy**

Law Reform Commission of Canada, *Bigamy* (1985) at 3 ..... 188
Note: Bigamous and Polygamous Relationships ..... 189
"Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 1 November 1991 ..... 191
"Community practices polygamy" *Globe and Mail*, 24 September 1990 ..... 192
"Polygamy Charges in Bountiful" *Globe and Mail,*, Jan. 8, 2009 ..... 194
"Legal Experts Split over Constitutionality of Oppal's Move Against Polygamy", *Globe and Mail*, Jan. 9, 2009 ..... 195
"Polygamy is Not Freedom", *Globe and Mail*, Jan. 14, 2009 ..... 196
Tom Flanagan, "The Biological and Philosophical Reasons why we should Prosecute Polygamy", Globe and Mail, April 24, 2008 ..... 196
Susan Drummond, "A Marriage of Fear and Xenophobia: Our Criminalization of Polygamy isn't about Protecting Women", Globe and Mail, April 6, 2009 ..... 198

**(e) Age Requirements for a Valid Marriage**

Note ..... 200

**(f) Prohibited Degrees of Consanguinity and Affinity**

Note ..... 200
"Incest: an age-old taboo", BBC News, March 12, 2007 ..... 202
"Court annuls marriage between twins separated at birth", *The Guardian*, Jan. 12, 2008 ..... 203

**(g) Consent as a Requirement for a Valid Marriage** ..... ~~183~~ 204

Note ..... 204

(i) Duress

Note: *Scott v. Sebright* (1886), 12 P.D. 21; *Cooper v. Crane*, [1891] P. 369; *Buckland v. Buckland*, [1967] 2 All E.R. 300 ..... 205
*S.(A.) v. S.(A.)* (1988), 15 R.F.L. (3d) 433 (Ont. U.F.C.) ..... 206
Note on Arranged Marriages: *Parihar v. Bhattie* (1980), 17 R.F.L. (2d) 289; *Singh v. Singh* (unreported, Ont. U. Fam. Ct., 13 June 1980) ..... 210
Bruce Ziff, "Recent Developments in Marriage and Divorce" (1986) 18 Ottawa Law Review 121 at 133-134 ..... 211
David Bradley, "Duress and Arranged Marriages" (1983) 46 Modern Law Review 499 ..... 211

(iii) Limited Purpose Marriage (Immigration Marriages)

*Asser v. Permohamed* (1984), 40 R.F.L. (2d) 299 (Ont. H.C.) ..... 214
Note: *Singla v. Singla* (1985), 46 R.F.L. (2d) 235 (N.S.S.C.) ..... 215
Note: *Salimi v. Torfehnejad* (2006), 32 R.F.L ($6^{th}$) 115 (Ont. S.C.J.) ..... 217
"Fraud squads chase down marriages of convenience" *Globe and Mail*, May 28, 2008 ..... 217
"Wife jailed for sham marriage" CBC News, Oct. 1, 2004 ..... 219
"Spouses can sue each other for tortuous deceit", Cristin Schmitz, *Lawyers Weekly*, April 7, 2006 ..... 220

## III. DIVORCE

**A. The Social Context of Divorce**

Ann Marie Ambert, "Divorce: Facts, Figures, and Consequences" (Vanier Institute of the Family, 2005) ..... 222
Note: Recent Divorce Statistics, 2004-2005 ..... 236
Julien D. Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown" (1989), 20 *R.G.D.* 109 ..... 236

**B. Reform of Divorce Law**

**(a) The Movement to No-Fault Divorce**

H. R. Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce" in R.S. Abella and C. L'Heureux-Dubé, eds., *Family Law: Dimensions of Justice* (1983) ..... 239
Note on history of divorce legislation in Canada ..... 242
Bruce Ziff, "Recent Developments in Canadian Law: Marriage and Divorce" (1986) 18 Ottawa Law Review 121 at 137-147 ..... 242
Dept. Of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act, Phase II: Monitoring and Evaluation* (May, 1990) at 1-9 ..... 246

**(b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce**

Lenore J. Weitzman, *The Divorce Revolution* (1985) at 362 ..... 250
Marygold Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children" [1986] *American Bar Foundation Research Journal*

759 at 770-771 ..... 253
Note: Other Critiques of No-Fault Divorce ..... 234 254
"Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce" *Globe and Mail,* 15 March 1988 ..... 256
"Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?" *Lawyer's Weekly*, 25 March 1988 ..... 257
Note: *Valenti v. Valenti* (1996), 21 R.F.L. (4th) 246 (Ont. Gen. Div.) ..... 259
"Victim is sued for support", Toronto Star, Jan. 23, 2001 ..... 260

**C. Obtaining a Divorce Under the Divorce Act, 1985**

**(a) Grounds for Divorce**

(i) Living Separate and Apart

*Rushton v. Rushton* (1968), 66 W.W.R. 764, 2 D.L.R. (3d) 25 (B.C.S.C.) ..... 261
*Dupere v. Dupere* (1974), 19 R.F.L. 270, 9 N.B.R. (2d) 554 (Q.B.) ..... 261
*Calvert v. Calvert* (1997), 32 O.R. 281 (Ont. Gen. Div.) ..... 263
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division ..... 264
Note: Alternative to Separation as a "No-Fault" Ground for Divorce ..... 264

(ii) Adultery

"Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge"
*The Globe and Mail,* 1 May 1990 ..... 265
Mary Ann Glendon, *The Transformation of Family Law* (1989) at 286-287 ..... 266
Note: Social Acceptance of Adultery ..... 267
Note on Definition of Adultery ..... 267
*P. (S.E.) v. P. (D.D.)* (2005), 259 D.L.R. (4th) 358 (B.C.S.C.) ..... 267
"Wife wants divorce for virtual adultery", Ananova, 2005 ..... 273
Note: Proof of Adultery ..... 273
*Burbage v. Burbage* (1985), 46 R.F.L. (2d) 33 (Ont. H.C.J.) at 36-38 ..... 273
Note: *d'Entremont v. d'Entremont* (1992), 44 R.F.L. (3d) 224 (N.S.C.A.) ..... 274

(iii) Cruelty

*Knoll v. Knoll*, [1970] 2 O.R. 169, 1 R.F.L. 141 (C.A.) ..... 274
Note : *Chouinard v. Chouinard* (1969), 10 D.L.R. (3d) 263 (N.B.C.A.) ..... 276
*Austin v. Austin* (1970), 2 R.F.L. 136, 73 W.W.R. 289, (Sask. C.A.) ..... 277
*Gilbert v. Gilbert* (1980), 18 R.F.L. (2d) 240, 39 N.S.R. (2d) 241 (T.D.) ..... 278
*B.(Y.) v. B.(J.)* (1989), 20 R.F.L. (3d) 154 (Alta. Q.B.) ..... 281
*J.G.S. v. W.O.J.S.*, 2004 BCSC 749 ..... 283

**(b) Duties and Bars to Proceedings**

(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion

Introductory Note ..... 284
Christine Davies, *Family Law in Canada* (1986) at 417-437 ..... 285
Note: *Guglielmo v. Mikhail* (Que, S.C., March 1991) ..... 288
*Johnston v. Ahmed* (1981), 22 R.F.L. (2d) 14 (Alta. Q.B.) ..... 289

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support

Note ..... 290

(iii) Religious Bars

"Family Lawyers Get Change" *Law Times*, 1990 ..... 291
*Bruker v. Marcovitz,* [2007] 3 S.C.R. 607 ..... 292